

Appendix 5: Details of evaluation of individual concept notes

1. CN Leader: Prof. F.K. Bee

Title: The Role of Agricultural Marketing Cooperative Societies in Mitigating Climate Change impacts on Land and Forest Resources in Tanzania

Parameter	I	II	II
Score	40	43	39
Strength	The title is very relevant, and there is some background information and relevant main points specified	Nil	
Weakness	<p>The research objective is not adequately specified, and in general the concept note does not have a clear focus/ does not become specific. There is no mention of women's participation.</p> <p>With e.g. a focus on existing functioning of cooperative societies, a more specific concept note could be achieved. These already exist in Tanzania as mentioned, and there are examples of cooperatives or similar organised business units, that already work with adaptation to and mitigation of climate change, such as eg. spreading knowledge and support for biochar production leading to improved production, productivity, profitability, amount of produce sold through the cooperative/apex entities, and thus increasing the relative income for the cooperative/farmer steered business unit, and increases income for the farmers (eg. in Muheza, Handeni, Kilombero and Mbarali).</p>	<p>The proposal is based on the premise that there are AMCOS in Tanzania which have active members who can be mobilized by them to undertake the activities outlined in the study. The reality in the ground is highly doubtful.</p> <p>Very low probability of achieving specific objectives</p> <p>Outputs/Outcomes mostly hypothetical</p>	<p>This is not a research problem as such, rather an institutional challenge to the cooperatives. I do not believe this research programme is the correct source of funding for an otherwise sensible question. That cooperative management may wish to draw on expertise from the proposers is probably wise but this should not be financed from an external research programme.</p>
Recommendation	Not recommended for acceptance	I would therefore not recommend this Concept Note to the next stage	Not recommended

2. CN Leader: Dr. Ladislaus B. Chang'a

Title: Enhancing accuracy and reliability of weather and climate prediction for effective climate change adaptation and mitigation in Tanzania

Parameter	IX	VI
Score	74	42
Strength	The proposed project has relevance to the stated thematic area one. The project objectives and outcomes will be useful in enhancing weather forecasts and climate prediction in the targeted areas and Tanzania as a whole.	The Concept note has several interesting elements and is dealing with important climate issues. Improved early warning information is an important task.
Weakness	<p>Hypothesis is different from methodology and therefore should have indicated clearly if the discussion is on methodology and not hypothesis as indicated.</p> <p>It would be good if the researchers can refer to the current on going global effort of WMO in collaboration with other UN entities on the Global Framework for Climate Services (GFCS) which has the objective of enhancing provision of climate services in the countries.</p> <p>The budget seems to be very low not sure if the researchers understand the financial implications well.</p>	However, due to the complexity of climate issues and of weather prediction, this may become a huge task, which may be too ambitious with the limited funds available to each study in the CCIAM program. The incorporation of this study with other studies can possibly be a solution, pooling the resources. The part which deals with dissemination of information to communities is important and may be widened.
Recommendation	Recommended	Not recommended

3. CN Leader: Dr L.D. Changa

Title: Assessing the vulnerability and adaptability of Marine Botanical Communities to the impacts of climate variability and change along the coast of Tanzania

Parameter	VII	VIII	V	VI
Score	25	54	39	56
Strength	The research title and the background are good.	Focuses on assessing vulnerability and adaptability- key inputs for mitigation of impacts. Problem statement well articulated.. Methodology clearly focused on each specific objective Indicative budget and schedule of activities provided.		The Concept note has several interesting elements and is dealing with important ecosystems.
Weakness	The research problem is not clear at all as well as the methodology. This concept note does not have any link with REDD issues.	Output/Outcomes of initiative not provided. Citations missing even in the methodology section of concept note – Standard methods for assessing: ecological status, tolerance levels, photosynthesis rates, etc. etc. are mentioned without such support.	It is difficult to identify what the work will involve from the title. Both the background and problem statement are mixed up. Wood chips from mangroves? For what? It is not clear (i) what is vulnerable; (ii) what is adapt? (iii) what the focus of the work is – marine botanical communities or coastal communities. The objectives are not achievable within the project setting – is it possible to reduce vulnerabilities from baseline studies? It is not achievable to generate projections at the scale that is being proposed.	However, my view is that it is too ambitious, dealing with a number of complex issues, in total five quite wide and rather general objectives. With the limited resources and time frame available for each study in the CCIAM program, the ambitions have to be scaled down and be more specific.

Recommendation	Not recommended (The concept note can be revised to take into account the objectives of the call)	Not recommended	Not recommended	Not recommended
----------------	---	-----------------	-----------------	-----------------

4. CN Leader: Dr. D.S. Matovelo

Title: Supporting the Vulnerable: Increasing the Adaptive Capacity of Pastoralists to Climatic Change in Longido and Ngorongoro Districts

Parameter	I	VII	III
Score	66	65	46
Strength	The concept note is very relevant, with good background information and a good research problem defined.	This is a very good concept note that follows the format and all the other points are clearly stated with achievable objectives.	
Weakness	The focus in the title needs to be integrated throughout the concept note if it is to be accepted: i.e. in addition to being able to specify the existing adaptive capacities, the vulnerability, the constraints and the opportunities for climate change adaptation for the pastoralists – it also needs to specify how to increase the adaptive capacity of the pastoralists. This means that the focus on increasing the adaptive capacity of pastoralists needs to be integrated into the following parts of the concept note if possible and relevant: the goal, specific objective no. 5, research question no. 5, outcome and output. There is much potential if the concept is stretched further to include this aspect of innovation further.	The weaknesses I have discovered are related to the methodology and the format that was not respected	There is much literature on this topic which illustrates that it is of importance. The concept note, however, has slight reference to this and it is unlikely that a research project as described will add much to the pool of knowledge, nor that it will solve an actual problem in the study area
Recommendation	Can be recommended for acceptance if the innovative development focus in the title, research problem and in the background - is further specified also in the objectives, outcome and output and the timeframe.	Very good Concept note that I strongly recommend for the next step.	Not recommended

	The methodology would in addition need to be quality assured concerning this aspect.		
--	--	--	--

5. CN Leader: Prof. D.S. Matovelo

Title: Assessment of Climate Change Information Management Methods for Policy and Decision Making in Tanzania

Parameter	I	III	IV
Score	34	35	51
Strength	The title/general theme of the concept note is quite relevant.		
Weakness	Under the research problem it is stated that there is limited information sharing without however specifying what the current information management systems are. There is a general lack of specification of existing situation and planned work, which gives insufficient information for specific assessment. The concept note is assessed as too general	This concept note does not go much beyond stating the problem. It has no reference to significant global literature on the topic. Instead of making it a research project, a literature review of international literature would assist in choosing strategies for Tanzania. But that is not a research topic for this research programme	Only a few local sources of information are cited. Experiences on this issue in other countries can improve the comprehension of the subject, and especially in 'background, and 'research problem'. First two specific objectives are essentially similar. Need to justify methodology employed and choice of study sites. Only Kisarawe is mentioned as having a REDD pilot while no similar information is available on the Dar es Salaam sites. Hence there is no certainty that all the work will be undertaken on REDD sites. Gender aspects as they relate to women and youth do not appear explicitly mentioned but a project of this nature will touch on them. A specific objective to guide the work along these lines would be desirable. This concept note has a very interesting title, but is poorly presented in terms of how this work can be done.
Recommendation	Concept note not recommended	Not recommended	This weakens the concept note considerably, and it should therefore be rejected.

6. CN Leader: Prof. J. Hella

Title: Economic Assessment of Climate Change Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability in Tanzania: The case of Pangani river basin.

Parameter	I	II	IV	V
Score	55	40	64	61
Strength	To assess economically the climate change impacts, adaptation and vulnerability with the case of Pangani river basin is very relevant. There is much good information, for example in the background concerning general climate situation and water as ecosystem service.	Nil		The subject of the title is very relevant especially to many climate change initiatives in that it will consider the socio-economic implications /impacts of the interventions. To a large extent, the concept note reads well giving the impression that proponents understand the basic issues.
Weakness	The research problem is somewhat unclear - it could be presented more stringently. The background information is not specified concerning economic assessment of climate change impacts, adaptation and vulnerability. The objectives, expected outcome and output and methodology could have included more on innovation and economic assessments and how to work with action research also on. The outcome and output could in addition be further structured. Methodology There is no mention of women's participation or gender relations	Background not well focused Research problem lacks clarity Research not well aligned to the title The main weaknesses of this proposal are in the poorly written statement of the research problem and also the background which contains some sweeping statements. However, the focus of the proposed study is quite relevant, and can therefore be redesigned in order to properly address the issues of climate Change impacts, adaptation and vulnerability in the Pangani Basin.	With respect to "background" literature/information available is largely limited to local/national experiences, blocking lessons from other countries. No literature/information on how 'economic assessments' have been done of these aspects. In stating the problem there is an apparent misunderstanding that REDD emphasizes 'planting of trees for carbon marketing'. This affects the development of the rest of the concept note. More literature survey could have corrected this. The title emphasizes 'economic	However, they will need to significantly improve the methods section

			<p>assessment' of the key variables in it, but this is hardly reflected in the objectives (only one touching on economic assessment explicitly), as well as in the ensuing methodology. All these shortcomings could largely be contained by eliminating the word 'economic' in the title.</p> <p>Need to justify the choice of sites for the study.</p> <p>Gender aspects as they relate to women and youth do not appear explicitly mentioned but a project of this nature will touch on them. A specific objective to guide the work along these lines would be desirable.</p> <p>This concept note has the major flow in the understanding of the scope for REDD as well as in understanding what an 'economic assessment' might entail. This should be corrected. I therefore recommend that it be revised and re-submitted because it addresses an important issue.</p>	
Recommendation	Not recommended immediately.	Not recommend.	Not recommended	Recommended

7. CN Leader: Prof. J.R. Kideghesho

Title: Synergies of Community Based Wildlife Management to improved adaptation strategies and mitigation of climate change impacts on ecosystem services.

Parameter	I	VII	III	V
Score	64	54	55	68
Strength	The focus is relevant – the synergies between community-based wildlife management to improved adaptation strategies and mitigation of climate change impacts on ecosystem services. The specific objectives and methodology are clear, and the outcome/output expected will contribute to innovation if achieved.	The research problem is very well sated and clearly presented.	This concept note offers an interesting twist to an old story. It could be worth exploring but only if the team looks closely at work done in neighbouring countries with much relevant experience (Zambia, Uganda..).	Methods section was well thought out.
Weakness	The background, research problem and overall objective are unclear. The outcome and output expected could be more specific and the logic more clear. There is no integration of women’s participation or gender relations assessed	The objectives are not clearly stated as well as the methodology. This may lead to poor outputs,	Note that the format of the note is not according to prescription.	The Title does not clearly show what will be done in the project – it needs refining. The objectives good save for specific objective (iii) which is not within the scope and context of the work. Objective (iii) might not be achievable.
Recommendation	Could possibly adapt with the above comments for eventual acceptance.	This concept note needs to be revised to address the objectives and the methodology before the development of the main project document.	None	The Concept Note is acceptable and Is Recommended to Proceed to the Next Stage.

Programme recommendation: PI disowned the CN

8. CN Leader Dr. A. Kijazi

Title: Adaptation to Cope with Extreme hydrometeorological Events for Innovative Land Use and Farming Systems in Western Tanzania

Parameter	VIII	IX	VI
Score	52	65	44
Strength	Seeks to link extreme hydrometeorological conditions and adaptation to climate change		The Concept note is dealing with land use and farming systems and their relation to hydrometeorological changes, thus dealing with important issues.
Weakness	<p>The research problem is one sentence and somewhat sounds like a title. Further work on it is needed.</p> <p>The background is a narrative with no express link with the proposed research.</p> <p>The methodology is not detailed enough. Linkages with key Ministries - e.g. Water and Irrigation(for the identification of catchment areas), Agriculture, Cooperatives , and Food Security (identification of farming systems), upon which further refinements from this study could be made; citations are conspicuously missing – a lone citation is found under Item No. 8. Some of the information given as “Activities” under “Outputs” belongs to the methodology section.</p> <p>The location of the study is not clearly stated. If it is to cover all (tree) Regions, the proposed budget (though the currency is unidentified) might not be sufficient to cover the area.</p> <p>Though indicative, some budget lines need a revisit. In Year I for example, transport, field allowances, and equipment, account for over 60 per cent of the budget. Year II seems to be “starved” , while in year III about 49 per cent of the budget goes to report writing. Curiously, thereis no allocation for transport and other items</p>	<p>The title of the proposal may need some refinement either through shortening it or reformulation to make it easily understood by the reader. The background does not clearly indicate why western Tanzania is selected for this study and also it is not clear if in defining the research problem the anthropogenically induced hydro-meteorological changes refer to those of weather or climate change scale. This may be necessary to know because the proposal mentions carrying out really time observations for some parameters.</p> <p>This is a multi-sectoral project hence at least two M.Sc. students may be required instead of just one student.</p> <p>The budget looks interestingly high and therefore there is need for elaboration.</p>	<p>However, my view is that it is too ambitious, dealing with a number of complex issues. With the limited resources and time frame available for each study in the CCIAM program, the ambitions have to be scaled down and be more specific. - Adding to this complexity is the fact that alarming negative changes we may observe not always be caused by general climate change and global warming, but can be related to local human interventions, such as deforestation, overgrazing or other poor land management practices, such as droughts and floods.</p>

	such as allowances		
Recommendation	Not recommended	Recommended	Not recommended

9. CN Leader: Prof. D.N. Kimaro

Title: Functional Relationships and Mechanisms Linking Biodiversity to Resilience/Adaptive Change of the Ecosystems in the Usambara Mountains, Tanzania

Parameter	II	VIII
Score	80	67
Strength	<p>Focused and relevant title Well presented background Research problem very well articulated Well outlined methodology Outputs//Outcomes likely achievable A very well written proposal focusing on issues of topical significance in the study area. The proposal could be improved by paying due attention to women participation in the process.</p>	<p>Background, Methodology, and Outputs are well put. Indicative budget convincing.</p>
Weakness	<p>Nil</p>	<p>Output No. 6 need be expanded to link resulting data use in rural development programmes to extend to revisiting land use policies and legislations. The activity time- frame seems to be constricted. Elucidation is needed.</p>
Recommendation	<p>Highly recommended t</p>	<p>Recommended</p>

10. CN Leader: Ms. R. Kitula

Title: Schematic modelling of impacts of climate change and evolution of mangrove forest governance structures in Tanzania

Parameter	VIII	III	IX
Score	70	76	83
Strength	The research problem, intended methodology, and output are well put. Indicative budget convincing.	This is an interesting concept note, well researched with meaningful appendices. The proposers have done good homework. It is weak on focussing on women.	The project proposal is fairly structured with a clear research proposal, objectives, methodology and expected outcomes.
Weakness	A sample of 12 villages, and given the distance to be covered, seems to be overwhelming. Is the selection based on main economic activities e. g fishing, rice cultivation, seaweed farming etc. In so doing, fewer villages will be selected while maintaining a spectrum of major activities?	Although the reference list is good a check should be made whether ongoing work in Tanzania (particularly if under the CCIAM umbrella) covers some of the proposal which should be adjusted accordingly.	The outcomes are very general that it is not too clear to see how the gender issues are addressed. Of course the budget will need to be further elaborated.
Recommendation	Recommended but revisit sample size	Recommended	Recommended

11. CN Leader: Prof. K.A. Kulindwa

Title: Mitigating REDD+ Additionality, carbon markets and community Participation

Parameter	VI	V	IV
Score	73	42	76
Strength	Well documented and quite relevant to one of the central issues in the REDD+ strategy. As I see it, it is very difficult to find credible and efficient instruments for the carbon credit accounting systems, such as the Clean Development Mechanism. A study on these challenges will be useful for policy makers, and may eventually lead to a search for better tools, not only linked to global carbon capture, but also to incentives for useful products for the local markets, based on sound land management practices.		This is a very well written concept note. The authors understand the subject well and know what they intend to do, how to do it, and expected results.
Weakness	None	The subject of the title is not clear. The methods section was poorly thought out and reads more like a discussion of the methods. Proponents allude to markets for carbon in Tanzania – it is not clear what is meant by this.	However, the relationship between CDM methodologies, especially those already developed for the forestry sector (see http://cdm.unfccc.int/DOE/scopes.html) and REDD+ is not explicit in the ‘background’ and ‘methodology’ sections. This is especially important given the wide scope of REDD+ (see its definition) and the limited scope of CDM to afforestation and reforestation. Hopefully, when a more robust project proposal is developed this will become clearer. Gender aspects as they relate to women and youth do not appear explicitly mentioned but a project of this nature will touch on them. A specific objective to guide the work along these lines would be desirable.
Recommendation	Recommended	Not recommended	Recommended

12. CN Leader: Prof. L.G.M. Kusiluka

Title: Community Engagement in Reconciling Biodiversity Conservation, Sustainable Farming Systems and Climate Change Mitigation

Parameter	I	II	VII
Score	56	60	24
Strength	The focus is relevant, and the overall objective is good. The outcome and output are well formulated. The special vulnerability of widow- and orphan-headed households is specified in research problem	This proposal can be improved by being more focused to the statement of the research problem and by logically outlining the key issues of interest in Makete District. A key strength of the proposal is the establishment of indigenous tree nurseries in the District, which is commendable. However, the tree species need to be mentioned	Nil
Weakness	The research problem, specified objectives, outcome and output expected are somewhat ambitious, and it is unclear whether it is possible to achieve all eight specific objectives (covering many areas simultaneously). It is somewhat unclear whether innovative models will be achieved. Women's participation and gender relations are not integrated further into the concept note.	Research problem can be better articulated be not well presented Research objectives not focused, too many objectives	The research problem is not clear and the objectives are not certain. Very poor methodology and the outputs can never be achieved through this concept note.
Recommendation	Not recommended for acceptance	This proposal can be merged with CN no 6 which also addresses almost similar issues in Njombe District. The two can complement one another by the incorporation of dairy farming and the planting of indigenous trees in both Districts.	I recommend to reject this concept note

13. CN Leader: Prof. E.J. Luoga

Title: REDD+ and its implications on enhanced ecosystem integrity and Local Community Livelihoods in Miombo Woodlands.

Parameter	IV	V
Score	63	63
Strength		The subject of the title, and indeed the research problem and the background are relevant.
Weakness	<p>The 'title' gives the impression that the study will cover all miombo woodlands area. Better make it reflect its specificity to the two regions in Tanzania.</p> <p>The 'research problem' is not very well articulated.</p> <p>The 'background' confuses REDD and REDD+, and does not adequately reflect on the state of knowledge on REDD+. It could cite/draw on work done by UNFCCC and others.</p> <p>With respect to 'research design' in the 'methodology' it is not clear how 'PRA approaches can be used to analyse the influence of deforestation on temperature and rainfall trends and patterns in selected landscape units'. Also the methodology assumes that temperature and rainfall trends and patterns are solely affected by deforestation. There is a need to substantiate this. Will the three year period give enough information to analyse these trends from the field experiments?</p> <p>5. Gender aspects as they relate to women and youth do not appear explicitly mentioned but a project of this nature will touch on them. A specific objective to guide the work along these lines would be desirable.</p>	<p>However, there are erroneous statements that are misleading: Rainfall and temperature differences observed between forested and deforested environments might not be due to climate change. This indicates that proponents might not be comprehending the delicate issues of climate change. Objective (v) is not realistic. It will not be easy to link rainfall and temperature to vegetation cover loss at the micro (local) level. Many researches will therefore not be answered.</p> <p>Although the methods are elaborate for a concept note, they are not explicit and do not indicate how they will lead to achievement of the objectives.</p>
Recommendation	On the whole, this is a fairly y good concept note, and I recommend that it be revised and re-submitted.	Recommended

14. CN Leader: Prof. H.V. Lyaruu

Title: Climate change and variability Impact on Biodiversity: Altitudinal Distribution and Assessment of two Potential Bio-indicator Plant Species in the North Uluguru Mountains, Tanzania

Parameter	VII	VI	V
Score	23	67	68
Strength	Nli	Important basic research, well stated, of wider interest than the national. The notes given to Note 7 on increased contents of CO ₂ in the atmosphere may be valid also for this study, if historical trends can be found. One such shows that old specimens (collected early in the Industrial Revolution) of nettle leaves found in Royal Botanical Garden, Kew show a higher number of stomata per square cm than at present, when concentration CO ₂ in the atmosphere is more than 30 per cent higher. A lower number of stomata per square cm may imply plants with higher drought tolerance.	The objectives are well thought though.
Weakness	The concept note is poorly developed. The background, objectives and methodology for data analysis are not clear at all. Hence my fear for not achieving the outputs.		Although the idea of bio-indicators of plant species is good, it would appear the concept was hurriedly assembled without adequate thought into the underlying issues. This can easily be dealt with. It is not clear why only two species are being considered. Could it be that these have previously been considered and found useful, in which case that would reduce the significance of the work. The background is largely detached from the research problem.
Recommendation	Not recommended	Recommended	The concept note is acceptable and is recommended to proceed to the next stage

15. CN Leader: Prof. S.S. Madoffe

Title: Quantification of Carbon Stock Changes under different Forest tenure and their Implication to Livelihood in Miombo woodland, Tanzania

Parameter	VII	III	VI
Score	45	68	79
Strength	The title is good and related to the main theme. The objectives and the outputs are slightly satisfactory.	This is an interesting approach, worthy of being considered for a project if it is moved significantly from the general level and sharpened	The Concept note deals with a central issue, the management of Miombo woodlands in Tanzania, important for a large part of the poor rural population. In this field I think there sometimes has been given too much attention to negative disturbance pressure such as firewood and pole collection and (over)grazing. - Woodlands may also be a source of sustainable yield of wood when the harvesting is planned and balanced. Also moderate and controlled grazing may sometimes be beneficial, as it may contribute to less violent and less destructive grass fires. If examples are found of early or controlled burning in the study area, the effects of this would be of special interest to register. Such interventions need a proper organization, but are not costly, and will normally improve the regeneration of valuable tree species.
Weakness	The methodology is not clear and may not lead to achieving the output and outcome expected even though the research title is in line with the thematic areas.	This could also be achieved through study of literature which is poorly referenced in the note.	Nil
Recommendation	The concept note needs to be revised to address the methodology	Recommended	Recommended

16. CN Leader: F.S.S. Magingo

Title: Application of mycobiotechnology in afforestation to mitigate climate change effects for sustainable livelihood

Parameter	VII	VIII
Score	72	77
Strength	Many interesting points are developed in this concept note.	The background, research problem, methodology, and output sections are well worked out. Other sections such as research objectives, relevance to REDD also attract high rating.
Weakness	The number of pages is not respected	Mycorrhizae are also sensitive to harsh conditions. Thus as agents for tree growth promotion, one has to consider their tolerance to hardship as well. <i>Pisolithus</i> for example, dies and somewhat ceases to function in the dry season. Thus fungal species capable of bracing both wet and severe drought scenarios are the most wanted.
Recommendation	Very good concept note. I highly recommend for the next step	Also considered, is the use of a combination of fungi as inocula. This serves as a safety net – not all eggs are in one basket. Typically, the screening covers/focuses on: tree – fungus -fungi interactions.

17. CN Leader: F.S.S. Magingo

Title: Conserving forest by using endophytic fungi isolated from medicinal plants to make anti-diarrheal medications.

Parameter	VII	VIII	V
Score	36	62	37
Strength	Research title and the research problem are good.	A good contribution towards reduced child mortality. Proposed methodology and anticipated outputs inviting.	
Weakness	Even though the research title is in line with the thematic areas, the way the methodology and the outputs are presented cannot deliver expected results.	Concept lacks a comparative element with existing, popular drugs. Will the products developed be just as good, of wanting performance, or be in the superlative? To this end bullet Nos: 1, 3 and 4 in Item No. 7 of the CN need a revision.	The linkage to the whole concept of climate change and REDD is loose save for the mention of reduced harvesting. The whole concept is not well thought out.

Recommendation	The concept note needs to be revised to take into account the methodology and reformulate the outputs	Recommended	The concept note is not acceptable.
----------------	---	-------------	-------------------------------------

18. CN Leader: Dr. G.E. Mbeyale

Title: Piloting apiculture for Sustainable Natural Resource Management among small scale farmers as a strategy for mitigating and adaptation to climate change.

Parameter	I	II	VI
Score	61	50	75
Strength	The concept note builds on and wishes to scale up from a former SUA-supported project, and intends to uncover more facts in some research gaps such as “the economic, ecological and social impact of pollination by bees when the beehives are hanged in the cropped land, the types of trees and shrubs most preferred by bees as fodder and the effectiveness of bees in the management of natural resources	Nil	I find this an interesting and well planned study. Apiculture can give alternative livelihoods, is within reach also for poor families, and have useful side effects, especially as regards pollination. A side effect of proper pollination may also be improved good ground cover, as fruit tree crops and other crops may attain a higher value and thus be better protected
Weakness	It is not clear, even though the outcome and output are relevant – if it is sufficiently innovative or rather an up-scaling with a few adaptations of a former pilot-project. The title specifies is a pilot, while the research problem mentions it is up-scaling of a former pilot.	The proposal’s main weakness is in the lack of clarity in the research problem statement as to what exactly is being investigated? Is it the merit of apiculture, the use of the SUAITATOBÉ or what? As for apiculture is this piloting or out-scaling of a technology already tested in Lushoto and Moshi districts? Needs to be more focused as to what is actually being investigated.	None
Recommendation	The concept note has many strong and clear parts, while some need development – however, since it seems to be up-scaling of and already documented well functioning model, it is not recommended for acceptance. The concept/model should be applied for up-scaling (other resources) due to its proven relevance!	Not recommended	Recommended

19. CN Leader: Prof. R.H. Mdegela

Title: Integrating dairy And Crop Production in Conservation Agriculture to Enhance Adaptation To and Mitigation Of Climate Change in Njombe District.

Parameter	I	II	III
Score	63	76	66
Strength	The concept note is relevant in terms of climate change adaptation and mitigation. It scores on the upper level at each of the parameters assessed	Well presented background Well stated research problem Well outlined research objectives Achievable outputs/outcomes	Although poorly referenced this is a holistic approach to everyday agriculture with considerable promise. A research proposal and a successful outcome of a project could add significant guidelines to improve traditional crop-livestock systems
Weakness	It is too broad, covering dairy farming, conservation agriculture, management/utilisation of gray water, manure application for gardens and biogas production in addition to establishing a youth club for demonstration. There is not mention of women's participation and gender relations. The concept could have been some further refined and the innovation more clearly defined.	However in the Methodology there is a mention of the of establishment of a Farmer Field School (FFS) which is actually not a FFS. Probably the author intends to establish an Agricultural Resource Centre.	Poorly referenced
Recommendation	Not recommended for acceptance, despite many strengths, unless adapted on the above specified areas	Explore the possibility to merge with CN no 4 in order to exploit the synergies of the two proposals in the two neighbouring districts of Njombe and Makete and develop one full proposal	Recommended

20. CN Leader: Dr. M. Mdemu

Title: Assessing leakage levels in REDD pilot project areas in Tanzania

Parameter	VII	V	IV
Score	76	42	76
Strength	Very strongly developed concept note		The concept note addresses a very interesting subject and is fairly well presented
Weakness	Nil	The subject of the title is not clear. The methods section was poorly thought out and reads more like a discussion of the methods. Proponents allude to markets for carbon in Tanzania – it is not clear what is meant by this.	<p>Missing any reference to literature in ‘background’ section; and for statistics given there is no reference to any literature that backs them.</p> <p>In ‘problem’ section, reference to literature/information/experiences on similar problem areas could strengthen the section.</p> <p>In the objectives and methodology how will ‘representatives case studies’ be selected?</p> <p>Gender aspects as they relate to women and youth do not appear explicitly mentioned but a project of this nature will touch on them. A specific objective to guide the work along these lines would be desirable.</p>
Recommendation	Very good concept note. I highly recommend for the next step	The concept is not acceptable	It be accepted subject to incorporating the above observations

21. CN Leader: Prof. H.B. Moshi**Title: Adaptation and Climate Change: The Case of Rainfed and Irrigated Farms in Manyara Region**

Parameter	II	III
Score	32	29
Strength	Nil	
Weakness	Sketchy title Sketchy background Research problem far fetched Outputs/outcomes very unlikely to be attained	Adopting irrigation in a dryland area is a highly complex issue. Many financial, social and technical aspects seem to be overlooked in this concept note which seems to this reviewer to be simplistic.
Recommendation	Not recommended	Not recommended

22. CN Leader: Prof. E.J. Mtengeti

Title: Rangeland Management Strategies for Adaptation and Mitigating Climatic Change in Agro-pastoral communities

Parameter	I	II	VII	III
Score	65	68	67	62
Strength	The concept note is clear – in title, research problem, background, objectives and methodology.	Well presented background Well articulated research problem Research objective aligned to the title The rationale for the study is quite convincing as stated in the background and problem statements. The methodology is also quite appropriate.	The research title, background, objectives and methodology are clearly stated.	An interesting concept note.
Weakness	It is not clear exactly what innovation is expected (more specifically) in the outcome and output specifically. With more specific information on e.g. what kind of innovative rangeland management practices are to be researched on, it could possibly be considered further. In addition, women's participation and gender relations need to be integrated.	However it is hardly feasible that the listed outputs will be achievable in the given time frame of three years!! There could be interim outputs in that time frame pending further investigation for up to 5 – 6 years.	The only weakness is on the research problem that needs to be well articulated.	It would however require a great deal of local participation to yield results. There is much literature on this subject – not quoted. The note warrants a further look.
Recommendation	Specific recommendation: Can be recommended for acceptance if expected outcome and output are specified with definition of what is to be achieved in terms of innovation as mentioned above.	Recommended	This concept note matches very well to the call; the applicants can revisit the research problem. Otherwise, I recommend it for the next step	

23. CN Leader: Prof. P.K.T. Munishi

Title: Assessment, Modelling and Prediction of the Response of Different Biota and Ecosystem Services to Climate Change Scenarios in Tanzania

Parameter	VIII	IX	IV	VI
Score	70	62	74	68
Strength	The background, research problem, proposed methodology, and envisaged outputs are inspiring. The relevance of this CN to REDD initiatives is also considerable.			Interesting and relevant study related to biodiversity and climate change. Important topic. A new and interesting part of such studies of change would be to also look into the effects of the increasing contents of CO ₂ in the atmosphere, which may boost plant growth, some plant species more than other, possibly leading to changes. Recent studies (not yet published) indicate that photosynthesis in the terrestrial biosphere of the Northern Hemisphere has increase significantly during the last 50 years. The same tendency may be valid also in the South.
Weakness	Phraseology focusing on outputs need be recast to make it less sounding like a classroom log frame presentation. Specifically, it has to focus on ingredients pointed out in Item No. 9 – Table 2 of CN Evaluation Guidelines.	The title for the proposal is unclear may be because of its length. The bullet on section two sounds like what would have been a good title for the study. The proposal is more an academic study but it does not mention any involvement of graduate students. This is something wrong.	The title gives the impression that this study covers the whole of Tanzania, while it is restricted to 'selected' sites. This aspect had better be reflected in the title. The first expected output is not clear; needs re-casting. With respect to "background" give citations on the prediction and also state when the prediction is expected to materialize. Gender aspects as they relate to women and youth do not appear explicitly	

			mentioned but a project of this nature will touch on them. A specific objective to guide the work along these lines would be desirable. The concept note is acceptable subject to incorporation of the above observations.	
Recommendation	Recommended	Not recommended	Recommended	Recommended

24. CN Leader: Prof. S. Mwakalila

Title: Development of Integrated Watershed and Community-based Climate Change Adaptation Strategy for Sustainable Water Resources Management

Parameter	VI	IX
Score	68	72
Strength	Interesting study, but should possibly be more limited, as the tasks may be too extensive.	The research proposal is well structured and clear. Otherwise this project proposal is very relevant to Tanzania national development. It has not been indicated if students will be involved in this research as per requirement. The budget looks fairly reasonable. The budget looks fairly reasonable.
Weakness	Also here the complexity may be larger than expected, as effects caused by changes in local land use (such as deforestation, overgrazing or other poor land management practices) sometimes may overshadow those caused by general climate change and global warming.	However the objectives and expected outcomes are not clear especially on the objectives hypothesis part were there are supposed to be three but four are shown with number two not being clear. For the outcomes it is not very clear if they reflected a clear link to REDD initiatives. Otherwise this project proposal is very relevant to Tanzania national development. It has not been indicated if students will be involved in this research as per requirement. The proposal was over three pages while the requirement is for three pages.
Recommendation	Recommended	Recommended

25. CN Leader: Dr. J.K Mwalilino

Title: Reducing emissions and environmental degradation associated with livelihood activities of communities around Lake Rukwa basin.

Parameter	I	II	III
Score	61	44	48
Strength	The concept is relevant with good background information, quite clear research problem and a good goal/overall objective. The methodology is good, being both participative and relevant. The output and outcome expected are generally good, and also include innovation	Nil	
Weakness	The research problem needs further focussing to be sufficiently clear - many themes are included, and it seems somewhat ambitious. The specific objectives are also somewhat ambitious covering various aspects simultaneously. The links between the hypothesis formulated and the objectives are not all clear.	<p>Very sketchy background Research problem too long and not well articulated Too many specific objectives Little chance of realizing outputs/outcomes</p> <p>The key words in the proposal are reducing of emissions and environmental degradation. However the methodology does not clearly spell out key activities that are geared towards achieving those objectives. The whole proposal needs to be realigned in order to focus a few key activities that can be addressed by the study in order to achieve the intended objectives. How can one effect one afforestation and reforestation in year 2 and 3 and thereby realize tangible outputs and outcomes??</p>	This concept note lacks focus and is poorly referenced. It is not very likely that local interventions are possible or will have major impacts. I think this concept note should not be followed up.
Recommendation	Concept paper not recommended for acceptance, even though there are several strengths there is a need of clearer focus.	Not recommended	

26. CN Leader: Prof. R.J.L. Mwamakimullah

Title: Modelling and Optimization of Rural Households Energy Mix for Reduction of Deforestation and Land Degradation in Central Regions of Tanzania

Parameter	III	VI	IX	IV
Score	55	68	77	57
Strength	This is a potentially interesting concept note, both at local and national level.. There is a credible emphasis on gender issues	Interesting and relevant study.	The proposal is a viable one and addresses practical issues that affect communities at local level in terms of energy mix use. It also provides means to mitigate and adapt to climate change as related to various fuel consumption.	
Weakness	But it does not go beyond generalities, and it is difficult to see how new knowledge will arise. This will be a challenge to the proposers, also to demonstrate that they are aware of global literature	But may need further elaboration, - perhaps with a more positive emphasis on the sustainable use of forest resources (which is possible and may not lead to deforestation, desertification or soil degradation, if properly managed), while an increased use of agricultural biomass sometimes may have some negative side effects – as the biomass may be needed for mulching and to uphold the productivity of the soil. In all cases improved energy efficiency is important, also to reduce local pollution.		Overall the concept note is poorly written, and with many grammatical errors and language problems in general. The authors confuse fuelwood with firewood, and are misleading the reader by stating that the main bio-fuel in Tanzania is from Jatropha (which they spell as Jatropher). The ‘background’ is mainly a repetition of what is already stated in ‘research problem’ and ‘objectives’. It is fairly thin on the state of knowledge on the subject. The ‘methodology’ and ‘expected output and outcome’ need re-casting for clarity. Gender aspects as they relate to women and youth do not appear explicitly mentioned but

				<p>a project of this nature will touch on them. A specific objective to guide the work along these lines would be desirable.</p> <p>6. This concept note appears to have been written in a hurry, with many grammatical errors and language problems in general. If this is the language style of the authors, then if they develop a bigger text it would be difficult to read and comprehend. It should therefore be rejected.</p>
Recommendation	Not recommended	Recommended	Recommended	Not recommended

27. CN Leader: R.J.L. Mwamakimbullah

Title: Comments on Evaluation of Different Management Options in Enhancing Resilience and Capability of Wetland Ecosystems to Sequester Carbon and Contribute to Community Livelihood

Parameter	VIII	IV
Score	72	72
Strength	<p>Points out that Carbon stored in wetlands is, at its lowest estimation level, 70 per cent of atmospheric Carbon. Thus estimations of wetlands' sequestration potential, is a well directed effort.</p> <p>The research problem and background are well articulated, and supported by citations.</p>	
Weakness	<p>The methodology seems to be too compact. It is dominantly an expression of intent(s). Specific mention of the tools to be used is missing.</p> <p>The location of study sites remains "floating". Specific mention of candidate site characteristics e.g. marshes/bogs/sedge vegetation as probable sites for gas exchange studies, etc. attracts a premium. Use of topographic maps is helpful in that regard.</p> <p>The project's time-frame needs further elaboration. So is the (missing) list of citations. This will however, be provided when a full proposal is submitted.</p>	<p>Re-cast title to reflect that the study will be undertaken in 'selected' sites in Tanzania; as it is difficult to tell where this work will be undertaken.</p> <p>The 'background' can be strengthened by more literature survey; only one citation is given.</p> <p>There are too many objectives, 9 in total. Possibilities for merging some be explored. Also this makes it difficult to follow in the methodology how the 9 objectives will be pursued.</p> <p>This appears to be a project that will require long term observations in order to achieve some of the objectives, and not the 3 years the work is planned to take.</p> <p>Gender aspects as they relate to women and youth do not appear explicitly mentioned but a project of this nature will touch on them. A specific objective to guide the work along these lines would be desirable.</p>
Recommendation	Recommended	This concept note is interesting and be accepted subject to incorporation of the above observation

28. CN Leader: R.J.L. Mwamakimullah

Title: Developing local based technologies for improved food security, land use plan and drought adaptation in semi arid areas of Tanzania

Parameter	I	II	IX
Score	39	54	75
Strength	The concept note has a very relevant focus, and is good on background information and research problem defined. Women's more vulnerable situation is mentioned.	Research objectives are fair	The project proposal is relevant to the theme and is addressing issues that are of greater relevance to climate change and food security issues. It also clearly addresses the interests of women.
Weakness	Overall, it is too general and does not specifically address what are the research objectives. Methodology and outcome/output are very general. Women's participation or consideration of gender relations is not mainstreamed in the concept note.	Title not well focused The title should have mentioned Meatu district straight away instead of "semi arid areas of Tanzania" Background is actually the problem Research problem is actually the background Methodology is too general Outputs/outcomes are sound but doubtful	
Recommendation	Not recommended for acceptance	Not recommended	Recommended

29. CN Leader: Prof. P. Mwangingo

Title: Investigating the potential of urban and peri-urban forests in offsetting carbon dioxide emissions and microclimate modification in Tanzania

Parameter	VIII	V	III
Score	69	35	43
Strength	Background, proposed methodology, and envisaged outcomes, well written		
Weakness	Micro climate assessment seems to be covered by one tool – the ENVI – Met Model. Is it best placed for the proposed CO ₂ quantification? Why not use a collection of models –if available; and compare the results with informed, popular opinion?	The larger part of the Concept Note is mixed up. Proponents do not appear to comprehend issues of/aspects of climate change and or energy usage and the linkage / relationships between them. Outputs are not well articulated.	The concentration of this proposal on (relatively) small areas makes this reviewer wonder if we are talking about very limited impacts (e.g. shade trees around buildings). It is difficult to see major CCIAM programme related results arising from this concept note.
Recommendation	Not recommended	Not recommended	Not recommended

30. CN Leader: H.J. Ndalagasi

Title: Modelling Combined Impacts of Climatic Change and Socio-Economic Stresses on Biodiversity and Rural Livelihoods in Kilosa District, Tanzania.

Parameter	I	VII	IV
Score	78	60	80
Strength	The concept note is clear, concise/specific and logical, and fulfils the objectives and requirements set in the CCIAM programme at large. It is holistically presented, integrating climate change impacts and socio-economic stresses on biodiversity and rural livelihoods – with the objective of presenting a model which can be used to inform design and implementation of effective integrated conservation-development strategies. It is thus innovative.	The objectives, outputs are clearly stated.	This is a very well written concept note that is clear and adequate in all aspects evaluated.
Weakness	Weaknesses: To improve, however, consideration of gender relations and women’s participation needs to be integrated as well, and all the elements in the proposal need to be further elaborated on the Final project proposal. Very good	An acceptable concept note; the main weakness is on the methodology. Diachronic study is what is needed but there is no reference on that. Revise the methodology before the next step	The methodology could have been more specific on which of the four components of REDD+ (see its definition) the project is targeting. Gender aspects as they relate to women and youth do not appear explicitly mentioned but a project of this nature will touch on them. A specific objective to guide the work along these lines would be desirable.
Recommendation	Highly recommended	Recommended but with revision of the methodology in the proposal.	On the whole, this is a very good concept note, and I recommend that it be accepted.

31. CN Leader: Dr. E.F. Nzunda

Title: Modelling Scenarios of REDD+ in Response to Regulation of Population

Parameter	II	IX	IV
Score	76	68	72
Strength	<p>Very concise Title Relevant and clear background Very well articulated research problem Very sound methodology Outputs/Outcomes well laid out The proposed research is very convincing from how it has been logically laid out and argued. The thinking is very clear and the processes seem to be very convincing. If it can be executed as presented, and if the intended outputs are realized the study will have provided vital inputs to policies on REDD in Tanzania</p>	<p>The project proposal addresses issues that are relevant to REDD activities.</p>	
Weakness	<p>Nil</p>	<p>Nil</p>	<p>The title gives the impression that this study covers the whole of Tanzania, while it is restricted to 'selected' sites. This aspect had better be reflected in the title. The first expected output is not clear; needs re-casting. With respect to "background" give citations on the prediction and also state when the prediction is expected to materialize. Gender aspects as they relate to women and youth do not appear explicitly mentioned but a project of this nature will touch on them. A specific objective to guide the work along these lines would be desirable. The concept note is acceptable subject to incorporation of the above observations.</p>

Recommendation	Highly recommended	Recommended	
----------------	--------------------	-------------	--