

RURAL DEVELOPMENT IN SWAT, PAKISTAN: UNDERSTANDING FOOD AND LIVELIHOOD SECURITY IN POST-CONFLICT CONTEXTS

BY INGRID NYBORG, BAHADAR NAWAB, KASHIF KHAN AND JAWAD ALI

NORAGRIC REPORT NO. 62
DEPARTMENT OF INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENT AND DEVELOPMENT STUDIES
NORAGRIC



RURAL DEVELOPMENT IN SWAT, PAKISTAN: UNDERSTANDING FOOD AND LIVELIHOOD SECURITY IN POST CONFLICT CONTEXTS

by

Ingrid Nyborg, Bahadar Nawab, Kashif Khan and Jawad Ali

Noragric Report No. 62
January 2012

**Department of International Environment and Development
Studies, Noragric
Norwegian University of Life Sciences, UMB**

Noragric is the Department of International Environment and Development Studies at the Norwegian University of Life Sciences (UMB). Noragric's activities include research, education and assignments, focusing particularly, but not exclusively, on developing countries and countries with economies in transition.

Noragric Reports present findings from various studies and assignments, including programme appraisals and evaluations.

This Noragric Report was commissioned by the Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation (Norad) under the framework agreement with UMB which is administrated by Noragric. Extracts from this publication may only be reproduced after prior consultation with the employer of the assignment (Norad) and with the consultant team leader (Noragric).

The findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in this publication are entirely those of the authors and cannot be attributed directly to the Department of International Environment and Development Studies (UMB/Noragric).



Norad



Nyborg, Ingrid¹, Bahadar Nawab², Kashif Khan³, Jawad Ali⁴.

Noragric Report No. 62 (January 2012)

Department of International Environment and Development Studies, Noragric

Norwegian University of Life Sciences (UMB)

P.O. Box 5003

N-1432 Aas

Norway

Tel.: +47 64 96 52 00

Fax: +47 64 96 52 01

Internet: <http://www.umb.no/noragric>

ISSN (printed version): 1502-8127

ISSN (online version): 1892-8102

Photo credits: Josie Teurlings (cover)

Cover design: Åslaug Borgan/UMB

Printed at: Elanders Novum

¹ Department of International Environment and Development Studies, Noragric, UMB, Norway

² Comsats University, Abbottabad Campus, Pakistan

³ Department of International Environment and Development Studies, Noragric, UMB, Norway

⁴ Research Consultant, Pakistan

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acronyms	iv
Executive Summary	v
1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND	1
1.1. Aim and Objectives	3
1.2. Relevance, scope and limitations	3
1.2.1. Study Area	4
1.2.2. Methodology and Approach	6
1.2.3. Research Process	7
2. SELECTED FINDINGS	8
3. WIDER PROJECT OUTPUTS AND IMPACT	13

ACRONYMS

ADB	Asian Development Bank
CIIT	COMSATS Institute of Information Technology
FATA	Federally Administered Tribal Areas
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GIZ	German Agency for International Cooperation
HUJRA	Holistic Understanding for Justified Research & Action (NGO)
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
IDP	Internally Displaced People
KP(K)	Kyber Pakhtunkhwa
MSc	Master of Science
NGO	Non-governmental organization
NWFP	North-West Frontier Province
PARRSA	Provincial Reconstruction, Rehabilitation & Settlement Authority
P&D	Planning and Development
PhD	Doctor of Philosophy
PDMA	Provincial Disaster Management Authorities
PKR	Pakistani rupee
TNSM	Tehreek Nifaz Shariat e Muhamad (Movement for the Enforcement of Islamic Law)
UN	United Nations
UNSCR	United Nations Security Council Resolution
UMB	Norwegian University of Life Sciences
UoS	University of Swat
WB	World Bank

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Norway contributes extensively to rural development activities in post-conflict areas, often through humanitarian and multinational organizations, with a strong mandate to ensure effective implementation of UNSCR 1325⁵. In Pakistan, the Norwegian Embassy is supporting several international and local NGOs as well as several UN agencies in humanitarian and development activities in Kyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) including Swat. Although not a conventional post-war context, KP has nevertheless experienced a military operation and remains a conflict-ridden region, making the challenges of development in this area somewhat similar to areas trying to recover from war. This research will contribute to a better understanding of the particular challenges of supporting rural development in these volatile areas as they move from a militarized to a civilian society.

The aim of this initial study is to explore the livelihood strategies of women and men in selected post-conflict/flood areas of Swat, and relate these to current development policy and programs. Using qualitative interviews of key informants (policy makers, government officials and development organizations) and focus groups of women and men from three selected villages in District Swat, we explore how livelihood strategies have changed after the conflict and 2010 flood, and how local women and men perceive and cope with different kinds of insecurity (food, livelihood, health, economic, personal, political and environmental). We look as well at how women and men perceive the roles of local and external institutions in responding to the crises, and how these different institutions see their own roles in dealing with insecurity and disaster recovery. Finally, we explore what implications a better understanding of food and livelihood strategies may have for development policy and programs in post-conflict areas of KP. The study was conducted by researchers from Noragric/UMB in collaboration with researchers from our partner institutions Comsats University, Abbottabad, and HUIRA, a local NGO in Swat.

The study is limited in scope and the findings preliminary. Nevertheless, we have a number of findings we feel are both interesting and relevant for policy makers and which should be followed up in further studies and policy exercises. These include:

- International and government authorities cope poorly with the vast differences, or non-uniform impacts of the conflict and flood.
- The current institutional landscape of development assistance hinders efforts of addressing the diversity of needs in a more integrated, effective manner.
- There is strong evidence in the development community of a lack of understanding and consideration of local, gendered responses to the conflict and flood.
- Narrow definitions of security as purely an issue of insurgents ignore other important ways in which the conflict and the flood have affected women and men's security. Purely military responses have limited impact on the need for other types of responses, particularly to support the interests and needs of women.

⁵ United Nations Security Council Resolution 1325 (2000): particularly the sections pertaining to the special needs of women and girls during repatriation and resettlement, rehabilitation, reintegration and post-conflict reconstruction.

Based on our preliminary findings we recommend that:

- The Embassy take a critical stance in relation to multilateral assistance to KP to promote a shift in assistance procedures (assessment, analysis, planning, implementation and evaluation) which better ensures real participation by local organizations, district officials and communities in defining their own development.
- The Embassy strengthens its focus on women, human security and development in all aspects of its support to KP. This can be done through facilitating synergies between its programs to be able to address the interrelatedness of development in the region.
- The Embassy put particular emphasis on competence building of local authorities (district) and organizations (district and community) in participatory assessment and analysis to strengthen their relative power in defining development priorities *vis à vis* external organizations.

1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

As the conflict in 2008/2009 in Swat, Kyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP)⁶, Pakistan, shifted from a purely military and humanitarian action to a post-conflict situation and people returned to their communities to revive their livelihoods, they faced challenges particular to areas which have experienced a high degree of insecurity. The effect of the conflict on agricultural production and resource management systems has according to humanitarian organizations been severe, and the food security situation remained quite serious. According to the ICRC, infrastructure was badly damaged during the conflict, wheat crop production ceased completely, livestock was lost, savings were run down and debt was incurred when the population relocated during the conflict period (ICRC Situation Report 2009). After the cessation of open conflict, humanitarian organizations continued to play an important role in providing food for returning IDPs and at the same time were investing in local livelihood revival. ICRC, for example, provided over 315,000 people in Malakand Division with wheat seed and fertilizer to assist them in producing crops for harvest in May the following year. In the meantime, they continued to provide food aid throughout the division. According to the authorities, security in the area remained volatile and complex. While the military action was officially over in late 2009, the civil police continue to be trained in military tactics to protect the population from the threat of renewed insurgency (Inspector General, Police, pers. comm.).

In July 2010 another disaster hit Pakistan, this time in the form of an immense flood. Close to 20 million people were affected throughout the entire country stretching from the high Northern Areas to the flood plains of Sindh. In the Swat valley, 12 major bridges and several major roads along the River Swat were swept away, isolating villages and destroying harvests which would have brought the communities closer to recovering from the earlier conflict, but which now for many represented a further and deeper setback to reestablishing their livelihoods. International humanitarian aid was mobilized on a large scale, with the United Nations taking the lead in establishing and coordinating international efforts and the Pakistani government organizing relief efforts mainly through the Provincial Disaster Management Authorities (PDMA). Initially given as relief, aid has been provided in phases for early recovery, rehabilitation, reconstruction and development. Particular emphasis has been given to livelihood revival with the intention of restoring rural livelihoods, including agricultural production, and providing employment opportunities to young men.

There is, however, reason to question an oversimplified approach to rural development in post-conflict KP, where development is often seen as being merely a problem of rebuilding infrastructure and providing agricultural inputs for restoring production as the police hold off insurgents. Previous studies of post-conflict rural development in, for example, Sudan and Sri Lanka (Shanmugaratnam et al 2009) and Afghanistan (Nyborg et al 2008) reveal that rural development in post-conflict areas is both complex and varied, involving shifting power relations among and between local and government actors and institutions, where some institutions may have become weakened, while others have been strengthened, and perhaps new or dormant

⁶ The name of Pakistan's formerly North West Frontier Province (NWFP) was changed to Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa on 1st April 2010. **Dawn** Source: <http://www.dawn.com/from-nwfp-to-khyber-pakhtunkhwa>

interests have emerged. Resource conflicts are common and can reflect both inequalities which existed before the conflict, as well as those which were created as a result of the conflict.

In our livelihood studies in Afghanistan, we saw how insecurity can take several forms, only one of which is the threat from insurgents. There are real challenges, for example, in ensuring the rights of vulnerable groups and protecting their interests as they attempt to re-engage in agriculture and resource management activities in post-conflict areas. It is important to understand, for example, how conflict and social change might be linked to domestic violence, or why poor women and men might not be able to claim their rights to land for agricultural production. Why some women may have problems participating in meetings organized for their support, or why providing sheep to widows for example would be dependent on understanding issues of access to pastures. Or understanding how some farmers trying to market their crops are hindered by either robbers or opposing power factions, or forced out of markets due to protectionism by established traders, or how daughters from poor households are sold in marriage to settle family debt. In particular, unequal access to and conflicts over water and land resources lead to situations of extreme insecurity for the vulnerable. Despite the complexity and diversity of conflict and power relations in post-conflict contexts, development continues to focus on the provision of inputs rather than understanding issues of power and access. Likewise, security continues to be perceived in terms of protection from insurgents rather than as an integrated element of ensuring food and livelihood security.

As in these cases, the situation in KP is more complex than reflected in current development and security policies. In fact, there are indications that development policy in KP is increasingly being influenced by security discourses, so much so that other aspects of rural development such as those mentioned above which may be critical for sustainable and equitable rural development are ignored (Mercy Corp, pers comm.). There are a number of underlying assumptions concerning the relationship between development, conflict and insecurity which need to be examined, particularly in light of multiple disasters. How are these disasters related, both in effect and response? Will investments in livelihoods lead to less conflict as well as less recruitment into the Taliban, or are there other factors (i.e. powered social relations, inequitable access to resources, climate change, protection of rights, voice and democratic processes) which need to be considered⁷? It is particularly important to learn what the impact of the provision of food aid and seeds will have on longer-term food and livelihood security, or on a broader human security – from other post-conflict (and post disaster) areas we know that unless there is a proper understanding of local processes before, under and following a conflict, food and seed aid may in fact disturb or inhibit local systems of sharing and exchange, and perhaps lead to aid dependency in the long run. In Swat, there is a need for a better understanding of how different people manage, or fail, to address food and livelihood security in this post-conflict, post-flood situation, and the implications this has on ways in which rural development is designed and supported. This would include an exploration of the current and potential roles of government and non-

⁷ Cf. our report 'Workshop on Livelihood, Security and Development in Post Conflict Swat, KPK, Pakistan', for a report on our preliminary discussions with Swat participants on the challenges of livelihood security following the military action in the Swat Valley.

http://www.umb.no/statisk/noragric/inst_coop/workshop_report_pakistan_final_.pdf

government institutions in addressing the various threats to food, livelihood and a broader human security.

1.1. AIM AND OBJECTIVES

The aim of this initial study is to explore the livelihood strategies of women and men in selected post-conflict/flood areas of Swat, and relate these to current development policy and programs. Specifically, the study addresses the following questions:

- How do the food and livelihood strategies in pre- and post-conflict/flood compare? How did they differ with respect to wealth, status, gender? Have they changed their livelihood strategies, and in what ways? Why?
- How do women and men, as well as communities as a whole, cope with different kinds of insecurity (i.e. food, personal, health, environmental, climate changes) as they pursue their livelihoods? Which local institutions and actors address different kinds of insecurity, and in what ways? Where do they fall short, and for whom?
- What types of development activities are being implemented by different actors in the post-conflict situation, and what is their impact on local food and livelihood security? In particular, what is the affect of the provision of food aid on longer-term food and livelihood security of different women and men in the communities?
- How do local women and men perceive the role of NGOs and the state in contributing to, preventing, or mitigating different types of conflicts (for example over resources)? How do NGOs and state actors perceive their roles and responsibilities in relation to the local community? How are issues of accountability perceived and practiced?
- What do people consider as possible options for improving food and livelihood security in the short and long term? Do these options differ between different actors (local women and men, NGOs and government)?
- What implications do a better understanding of food and livelihood strategies have for development policy and programs in post-conflict areas of KP?

1.2. RELEVANCE, SCOPE AND LIMITATIONS

Norway contributes extensively to rural development activities in post-conflict areas, often through humanitarian and multinational organizations, with a strong mandate to ensure effective implementation of UNSCR 1325. In Pakistan, the Norwegian Embassy is supporting several international and local NGOs, and the UN system in humanitarian and development activities in KP, including Swat. Although not a conventional post-war context, it has nevertheless experienced a military operation and remains a conflict-ridden region, making the challenges of development in this area somewhat similar to areas trying to recover from war. This research

will contribute to a better understanding of the particular challenges of supporting rural development in these volatile areas as they move from a militarized to a civilian society. As researchers we have been in close contact with the Norwegian Embassy in Islamabad in the planning and implementation of this study, where we have shared our ideas and findings, and they have shared important and relevant contacts for the study, as well as facilitated meetings and research permits. Since this study is of limited scope, it represents a preliminary investigation of food and livelihood security issues in post-conflict Swat, as an input into an emerging, longer-term research and education program⁸. The findings must be seen as preliminary, to be enhanced and tested as the study continues under follow-up programs.

1.2.1. Study Area

The Malakand Division of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) comprising Swat, Buner, Shangla, and Dir districts has remained deeply affected by militancy for the past several years. This region borders Afghanistan and is part of a greater conflict with the Taliban. It is home to an ethnically distinct group, Pakhtun, overlapping with neighboring Afghanistan. This is a high intensity conflict with a major geo-strategic significance. Although it is primarily viewed as an ideological conflict against militant or extremist Islam, the conflict is also rooted in socioeconomic deprivation which aids rebel recruitment and retention. The inhabitants of Malakand live in the rugged mountainous regions, where basic infrastructure is often lacking, literacy rates are low, housing and sanitation conditions are poor, access to safe drinking water is limited and pressures on food resources are high. In 2008 KP's Population Welfare Department estimated that 41% of the population of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa lives below the poverty line. The GDP growth rate in 2008/2009 was estimated at about 3% which showed a clear decline as compared to 5.7% four years earlier.

This study has been undertaken in the District Swat. Swat is a former princely state, incorporated into Pakistan in 1969, but retains a special legal status that is not prevalent elsewhere in the country⁹. The population of Swat was approx 1.3 million at the 1998 census, but is now estimated at 1.8 million. Swat is known for its relatively progressive development policies as compared to its tribal neighbors, with the Wali of Swat State (Miangul Jahanzeb) supporting education, and in particular girl's education, including the establishment of girl's high schools and colleges during the pre-Pakistani era. Livelihoods in Swat are based mainly on agriculture and trade, and until the recent conflict tourism was a major source of livelihood as well. In the lower areas larger scale agriculture dominates, organized in a feudal system of larger landlords and tenants. As one moves towards upper Swat, the nature of rural livelihoods become more diverse: landholding size diminishes and land ownership shifts to smallholders and from more crop-based to more orchards, forest and animal-based production systems.

⁸ See results below.

⁹ Swat, GlobalSecurity.Org available at: <http://www.globalsecurity.org/military/world/pakistan/swat.htm>



Figure I: Map of Swat¹⁰ (Swat shown in yellow)

Swat has a history of insurgent based conflict, which started in the early 1990`s through the defunct Tehreek Nifaz Shariat e Muhamad¹¹ (TNSM). However since around 2002, Taliban supporters began to resurface in the area and establish a base of support, which by 2007 managed to pressure the Government of Pakistan to agree to the implementation of some degree of Sharia law. Growing local dissatisfaction with the practice of this system culminated in an appeal to the Government of Pakistan to expel the Taliban from Swat. Consequently, in 2008 the government conducted a military operation against what they now termed the militants. It is estimated the 2.3 million people were displaced from Malakand Division during this operation, which was officially over after three months of intense fighting. Shortly after the operation was finished, people began to move back to their homes, with the assistance of the government and international community. The operation caused devastation of social and physical infrastructure on a large scale. Hundreds of thousands of people were internally displaced. These IDPs have

¹⁰ Source: Wikipedia

¹¹ Movement for the Enforcement of Islamic Law.

since August 2009 returned back to their homes, but they are still facing immense post-conflict difficulties. A research study carried out by Aryana Institute for Regional Research and Advocacy in April 2009 estimated the losses to the agricultural output in Swat due to the conflict at around 4 billion PKR per annum during 2008-09. With a pre-war output at 9 billion PKR, this amounts to a loss of 44% in terms of agricultural output. The farming sector engaged up to 56% of the labor force in Swat, during the conflict 30% of the labor force became jobless. Post-conflict rehabilitation and recovery programs have been in operation since IDPs returned as of late August 2009. The total estimated losses resulting from the conflict in Malakand Division amounted to US \$ 227.5 million¹².

In July 2010 the worst floods in memory hit Pakistan, affecting over 20 million people nationwide. Following the floods the Floods Emergency Response Plan¹³ was implemented, which was operationalized through the UN's cluster approach. The flood and conflict together had a devastating effect on the region as a whole; however, how they affected different villages and people within villages differently is less well known. The fieldwork for this study was conducted between September 2010 and February 2011 in three rural villages, chosen according to the following criteria:

1. The village where the conflict originated
2. A village greatly affected by the conflict
3. A village less affected by conflict

All three villages have also been affected by the floods, which allowed for investigation of how the conflict and flood together influence women and men's human security.

1.2.2. Methodology and Approach

This study was mainly qualitative, based on literature and policy document reviews, focus group and key informant interviews with women and men from Swat, IDPs settled outside of Swat¹⁴, international and local NGOs working in the post-conflict KP areas, and local and provincial government staff and officials. In the villages, the focus group interviews were arranged with women and men separately, and different groups were arranged for different wealth groups (well-off, medium, poor) and other relevant categories (i.e. landlords, tenants). The key informant and focus group interviews were based on a series of interview guides, mainly comprised of open-ended questions.

In trying to understand the relationships between different types of insecurities in this post-conflict and post-flood context, the research uses a human security framework. This means that we broaden a conventional understanding of security as hard security to encompass a broader spectrum of development concerns to include personal (violence), food and livelihood, health,

¹² In October 2009, the World Bank (WB) and Asian Development Bank (ADB) carried out the Damage Need Assessment (DNA) source: <http://www.pdma.gov.pk/PaRRSA/documents/DNA.pdf>

¹³ [http://ochadms.unog.ch/quickplace/cap/main.nsf/h_Index/Revision_2010_Pakistan_FERP/\\$FILE/Revision_2010_Pakistan_FERP_SCREEN.pdf?OpenElement](http://ochadms.unog.ch/quickplace/cap/main.nsf/h_Index/Revision_2010_Pakistan_FERP/$FILE/Revision_2010_Pakistan_FERP_SCREEN.pdf?OpenElement)

¹⁴ Initially those settled in Abbottabad

economic, political and environmental security¹⁵. In doing so, we investigate livelihood strategies in relation to the following thematic areas¹⁶ around which the focus guides have been developed:

- History and demographics of the villages
- Local infrastructure and government institutions and services (health, education, security)
- Migration/displacement
- Wealth and land ownership
- Food and livelihood security and vulnerability
- Land issues (use, institutions, access and conflicts)
- Water issues (use, institutions, access and conflicts)
- Livelihood strategies (labor and labor migration and IDPs, agriculture, livestock, trade, income earning activities)
- Conflict (case studies, informal and formal institutions)
- Security (perceptions, informal institutions, police, army)
- Decision-making, power relations and gender
- Social relations (marriage, divorce, family networks)
- Aid initiatives (humanitarian and development)

1.2.3. Research Process

The study has been conducted in cooperation with COMSATS University (CIIT), Abbottabad, and with the assistance of HUIRA, a local NGO working in Swat, KP. The research project idea originated from discussions with resource persons from post-conflict Swat during several workshops held by Noragric's partner institution, CIIT, in Pakistan in 2009. After further discussions with the Norwegian Embassy and Norad, Oslo, this research project was officially initiated in June/July 2010 with a planning and field training workshop at CIIT in Abbottabad. Resource persons and field staff from Swat attended and we spent three days designing question guides which would be used by the field staff to conduct the qualitative interviews in two villages in Swat.

The planning and training workshop was to be followed up by CIIT researchers to further support the field staff in the fieldwork. Unfortunately, the flood hit Swat only days after the workshop and due to the extent of damage in the field area and the need for both researchers and NGO partners to take part in the rescue and relief operations, the research was not initiated as planned. After three months, however, local partners indicated that they could begin to use some of their time on the field research for this study. They were highly motivated to continue with the study despite the difficult conditions. They requested Noragric to make a new trip to Pakistan in November to have a workshop to discuss how to conduct the research in the post-flood context, and to discuss how to integrate the post-flood situation with the ideas we had already discussed around post-conflict. During this trip we were able to conduct the workshop in Swat itself, and

¹⁵ See Human Development Report 1994, and Duffield, M. (2005) *Development, Security and Unending War*. Cambridge: Polity

¹⁶ This approach is based on the participatory livelihood studies conducted in Afghanistan, described in detail in Nyborg, I. et al. (2008) 'Exploring Rural Livelihoods in Afghanistan: A Study of 10 Villages in Dai Kundi'. Noragric Report No. 40. http://www.umb.no/statisk/noragric/publications/reports/noragric_report_40.pdf

managed to visit two of the villages which were identified for the study. We also managed to have meetings with government authorities in Peshawar concerning their perceptions of the post-conflict, post flood situation, and how they saw their role in responding to different insecurities. The project staff and CIIT researchers followed up these meetings afterwards, with field data collected in December and February.

Finally, in March 2011 we held an analysis workshop in Swat. The participants for the first two days were researchers and students from UMB and CIIT, Hujra field staff, and women and men from each of the three villages. For the last few hours of the workshop Hujra had invited a mix of intellectuals, media persons, activists and government officials to listen to some of the presentations and to discuss the implications of the research on development in Swat, as well as their own ideas around some of the issues addressed. The discussion was surprisingly candid and critical, illustrating that despite the sensitive security situation it was possible to critically discuss at least some aspects of development in a semi-public forum, as long as certain topics which directly touched on security issues were not voiced, and as long as the security agencies were satisfied that the research and discussion were transparent.

Throughout the study (and in our current research), the security situation has influenced the ways in which we have organized our work, particularly the fieldwork in Swat. Field access for non-Pakistanis was at times limited, and movement was at times restricted. The study was therefore highly dependent on the interest and assistance of our local partner, Hujra, in data collection. It also required that as partners they received enough guidance and training such that the quality of the data was assured. We therefore put a lot of emphasis on the training of field staff in qualitative methods. We also, however, emphasize that Hujra has participated fully in both the posing of research questions and the analysis of the data. Since Hujra itself is also an actor in Swat, this has required particular attention to issues of bias and self-reflection in designing and interpreting the results.

2. SELECTED FINDINGS

The data collected from the three study villages and key informants is rich, and will be presented in more detail in later reports and publications. A few key findings on issues we feel are important to consider in policy and future studies, however, can be summarized here.

1. International and government authorities cope poorly with the vast differences, or non-uniform impacts, of the conflict and flood.

This point can be illustrated by examining post conflict/flood food and livelihood security. Some of the general effects of the conflict and flood on food and livelihood security as expressed in the study communities can be summarized as follows:

- Effects of conflict:
 - Limited access to markets due to security checkpoints
 - Insecure markets
 - Lack of male labor in women-headed households where husbands and/or sons

- have been killed
 - Psychological stress and continued fear as a result of violence and insecurity limits participation in recovery activities (particularly women)
 - Crop loss and structural damage to fields (crops and trees cut down by both army and militants)
 - Worsened social and contractual relations between landlords and tenants
 - Continued mistrust in communities
 - Loss of production during IDP period, delay in production upon return
 - Loss of animals during IDP period
 - Dependence on food aid until first harvest
- Effects of flood:
 - Limited access to markets due to destruction of roads and bridges (rotting of harvests, lack of inputs)
 - Loss of standing crops
 - Infrastructural damage to irrigation systems
 - Loss of topsoil
 - Deep silt deposits on agricultural land
 - Dependence on food aid for longer periods
 - Lack of wage labor income due to decreases in production
 - Loss of negotiating power of poor tenants to access to land

While the entire area was affected in some way by both the conflict and the flood, the impact of the conflict and flood on people's food and livelihood security was very uneven. Some villages and households were greatly affected by the conflict but not by the flood, some by the flood and less by the conflict, some not much by either, and some greatly affected by both. Likewise, there existed serious inequalities in power relations and access to resources prior to the two crises, which have influenced in numerous ways how households are able to recover (land ownership and access, diverse income sources, gender, political affiliation). This has made the targeting of relief, early recovery and reconstruction a complex affair, particularly for the international community. Our data indicates that the targeting of aid was problematic. While larger infrastructural investments were more clearly beneficial to the area, food and livelihood support suffered from poor assessments and biased distribution. There appears to be widespread elite capture of resources, with the vulnerable not able to compete for access to these resources.

There have been several divergent explanations for this. The international community points to the lack of competence and sometimes corruption of local authorities and partners in assessment and aid delivery. The local authorities and organizations point to a lack of trust and disregard by the international community of their motivations and local knowledge of the area. These issues were not so apparent during the relief phase, where there seems to be a general agreement that food and other emergency supplies reached those who needed them. They do arise, however, as aid moves into the early recovery phase, and then further into reconstruction and development. This is the point where there seems to be a problem with the ability of the government and international community to respond to the unevenness of need, opportunity and means, which leads to the next point:

2. The current institutional landscape of development assistance hinders efforts at addressing this diversity of needs in a more integrated, effective manner

While both perspectives above on why assistance may not reach the vulnerable are probably true to some extent, our research thus far suggests that there are additional explanations which are important to consider. The most striking of these is the mismatch between institutional set-up of response and the complexity of ground realities. Despite growing evidence of the non-linear and non-uniform nature of post-conflict and post-disaster impact and recovery, in practice these crises are still conceptualized as a linear process which passes through particular stages: relief, early recovery, reconstruction and development. These phases, in turn, define how institutions organize both themselves and their activities. In Pakistan, this has taken a particular turn in that different institutions have taken responsibility not only for different phases, but for the different crises as well. In the KP government, for example, PaRRSSA¹⁷ is responsible for the IDPs and resettlement, and PDMA¹⁸ for flood relief, early recovery and reconstruction after the flood, but not the conflict, and not development, which is the responsibility of the line departments such as Planning and Development (P&D). These government offices decide as well when one phase ends and the next one starts, and aid organizations have to follow these dates in their planning and activities.

The implications of this are that in one village, one household might be receiving seed assistance for livelihood revival following the conflict through a PaRRSSA program, while a neighbor who suffered due to the flood and has the same need for seeds is not eligible and has to hope that their family at some point will be identified by a PDMA program. Perhaps more common is that in some villages, certain households remain in need of relief despite the official shift to early recovery, while others need support for livelihood recovery much earlier, even during the relief phase. Furthermore, the results show clearly that the two crises are so interlinked locally that it is counterproductive to treat them as separate crises. In fact, we find that **responses which are based on only partial understandings of women and men's diverse and complex insecurities and development needs connected to the conflict and the flood not only have limited impact, but can result both in increased inequality and increased insecurity precisely for those who are the most vulnerable.**

3. There is strong evidence in the development community of a lack of understanding and consideration of local, gendered responses to the conflict and flood.

There are two levels at which there are an almost complete lack of documentation and analysis of local responses to the conflict and the flood. The first is in the ways and extent to which Pakistani institutions and private families responded to the IDP situation and the flood. It is estimated in fact that the majority of IDPs were absorbed into extended families rather than in camps. In some of our interviews in Abbottabad we were informed that some households took in relatives 3-4 times the size of their immediate families and supported them without any

¹⁷ Provincial Reconstruction, Rehabilitation & Settlement Authority

¹⁸ Provincial Disaster Management Authority

government assistance for the 3-4 months the military operation lasted, and sometimes for longer than that. Educational institutions provided emergency assistance and perhaps others as well. Understanding which institutions responded and in what ways, and whether these institutions and private initiatives were able to provide assistance in a more or less efficient manner might give insight into ways in which assistance might be channeled in the future.

The second level is the responses of the affected themselves. The diversity of women and men's strategies to deal with different types of insecurity are seldom referred to in documents assessing the needs of local communities. This is particularly true of women's responses. The role of local institutions in addressing the security and development needs of women is also not well understood. Our study has, for example, found that in one of the villages there were specific women's committees (traditional) who listened to women's complaints and concerns and took these matters up with the village jirga¹⁹, while in another there were no specific women's groups, rather a process through which women used a personal male contact to solve their problems. It is important that outside actors (government and civil organizations) understand these different contexts, including their relative strengths and weaknesses in addressing women's needs, such that appropriate institutional arrangements are developed.

As mentioned above, the institutional set-up and the processes of assessment and response do not support the participatory processes which would be necessary to uncover such diverse local responses. Local partners may indeed have experience and approaches which are able to engage local women and men in a more participatory way, such that assistance could better reflect diversity. However, the relationship between local partners and aid organizations in KP reflect significant power differences which has had consequences for the response. Most of the assistance after the flood has been organized through the UN cluster system. While this system seems to have improved the coordination of donors themselves, it may also have contributed to a concentration of power in the donor community where local organizations which are not so adept at communicating with this system have little say in how aid is prioritized and provided. Several local NGOs interviewed have complained that they are merely subcontracted by larger organizations to implement already designed programs, and have limited influence in strategic decisions. Finally, while the development assistance provides many jobs in local organizations, particularly for women professionals, these are of short term. What are the implications of short-term, insecure contracts? Do these professionals stay in the area afterwards, or do they leave the area and represent a local 'brain drain'? The longer-term consequences of this temporary distortion of the local labor market of professionals needs much closer examination.

4. Narrow definitions of security as purely an issue of insurgents ignore other important ways in which the conflict and the flood have affected women and men's security. Purely military responses have limited impact on the need for other types of responses, particularly to support the interests and needs of women.

| According to the official narrative, the main security issue was and remains the presence of militant insurgents. The military operation was required to move the population out of Swat, expel the militants, resettle the population afterwards, and assist humanitarian organizations directly with relief and provide security from insurgents through a military presence. According

¹⁹ Council of elders

to government officials, security is improving (fewer incidents), and local security is being transferred to the civil police and the 'community police', which are often young boys with sticks who are hired as informants for the police. Everyone has moved back to their places of origin; those who haven't have chosen to live elsewhere.

Our study has begun to reveal a somewhat more nuanced narrative. We find that most would agree that the majority of IDPs have returned, mobility is much improved (particularly for women), and that the number of incidents has decreased. However, the villagers are very clear in their perception that the leaders are still at large, which means that there is still a good deal of insecurity, but at a different level than earlier. Women health workers, for example, faced severe hardships during the Taliban rule and were directly confronted by armed militants while trying to provide vaccinations. While they were threatened, the women knew these militants, as they were usually from their local community, and the women could call on social networks for support. Now, however, they do not know who and where threat is based, but still feel threatened.

Quite a few IDPs have stayed away, both for political and economic reasons. Some former landlords, for example, have lost everything and have problems recovering their land from tenants who may have sided with the Taliban. Many of the political IDPs had to leave Swat long before the official displacement period due to threats to their lives. They still remain uncertain as to whether it is safe for them to return.

In the villages, the defense committees organize patrols of villagers and report to the army anything suspicious. Officially these committees are voluntary; however, it is expected that everyone who is asked has to participate. The villagers see these committees as a double-edged sword. They agree that they, as villagers, should be assisting the army in identifying nefarious strangers appearing in the village who may be potential militants. On the other hand, the army is seen to be taking too much space in the local communities in terms of local conflict resolution. It is the army who decides who should be punished as insurgents, and who should be 'forgiven'. Local, traditional institutions which have in the past been responsible for conflict resolution have apparently been weakened and there is resentment that it is the army that is making these types of decisions. Underlying local conflicts from earlier times remain, while recent conflicts are in their eyes not adequately resolved. Despite these issues, there is little they feel they can do, since it is not possible to criticize the army. They hope things will be better as the army gives more space to, for example, the police.

Concerning the role of the civil police, both men and women feel they have in fact improved since they have been working together with the army. They are seen as more professional, and responsive to the community's security needs. They also expressed that the community police could play a role in keeping order in the communities, although this arrangement was still quite new and their actual role and effectiveness in preventing crime not clear. In Swat, the community police are mainly young, unemployed, men hired to fight petty crime, mainly as unarmed informants for the police. The focus on their role as informants limits their potential to contribute to, for example, good relations between the police and the local communities in the future, or to assist the police in protecting the broader rights of the village women, men and children. Currently, the police have a rather distant relation to the communities and it is unclear the extent to which women, for example, have access to police protection (against violence,

against infringements on their rights to property and other resources) when the police stations are to an increasing extent barricaded against attacks by militants. The role of female police officers in Swat, for example, is not discussed, as the villagers claim they did not even know there were female officers – there are in fact several stationed in Mingora, but are mainly restricted to the police station. This is an issue that needs further investigation as the civil police take on more responsibilities for security.

Finally, the ways in which a broader set of human security issues are entangled in livelihood revival are many, as seen in the first section above. Some of these are indeed hard security issues which require military action, while others require that local institutions work in a more coordinated manner to address overlapping or complementary interests and rights. Policy that only addresses selective parts of these processes will be both ineffective and unsustainable.

Based on our preliminary findings, we recommend:

- The Embassy take a critical stance in relation to multilateral assistance to KP to promote a shift in assistance procedures (assessment, analysis, planning, implementation and evaluation) which better ensures real participation by local organizations, district officials and communities in defining their own development;
- That the Embassy strengthens its focus on women, human security and development in all aspects of its support to KP. This can be done through facilitating synergies between its programs to be able to address the interrelatedness of development in the region;
- The Embassy put particular emphasis on competence building of local authorities (district level) and organizations (district and community) in participatory assessment and analysis to strengthen their relative power in defining development priorities vis a vis external organizations.

3. WIDER PROJECT OUTPUTS AND IMPACT

Norad, Oslo, and the Norwegian Embassy in Islamabad have put special emphasis on ensuring that this study contributes to local organizations and development processes. We can inform on the following, which have been the direct result of this particular study:

- Creation of a network of resource persons in Swat interested in conducting and/or learning from research on development in their volatile context.
- Competence-building of local field staff in qualitative research methods (continuous).
- Integration of the study into CIIT's MSc Development Studies Program
 - o Results and methodology included in teaching curriculum
 - o Inclusion of MSc students in the research
- Integration of the study into Noragric's Development Studies curriculum (MSc), and linking of one Pakistani PhD directly to the study.
- Initiation of a dialog between organizations working in Swat (including, but not limited to, several receiving funding from the Embassy) on the issues being studied.

- Establish a link between CIIT and the University of Swat (UoS) such that CIIT can support UoS Development Studies program (through field methodology course).
- Creation of interest in provincial authorities to include the research results in their post-conflict and post disaster activities (PDMA/PaRRSA).
- Regular meetings with the Embassy during each visit to Pakistan to update on the progress and findings of the study, and discuss synergies with related development activities in the area.
- Based on the findings concerning the role of civil police in post-conflict contexts, a Memorandum of Understanding has been signed between CIIT, UMB, HURJA and Rozan, and a joint proposal for specific, applied research and curriculum development on civil police - community relations in Swat is under development. Rozan is a Norwegian-funded Pakistani NGO who has for the past 12 years trained police in gender and human rights, and will at the request of the provincial government start a new training program in KP.
- Based on the findings and experience from this study, a larger research application was prepared for the Research Council of Norway, resulting in a new three-year research program entitled: 'Gender, Human Security and Development in Post Conflict Pakistan: Policy implications of local, gendered understandings of security and Development'. In this new program,
 - o one Norwegian PhD, and two PhDs and 4 MSc students from CIIT are conducting research on gender, security and development in Swat;
 - o two PhD students from two other Pakistani universities are linked to the project.
- Requests from other organizations, i.e. GIZ²⁰, for advice on how to conduct similar studies in, for example, FATA²¹.
- In addition to the workshops we have organized through the project, the work in Swat has been presented for the UN Women's Network in Islamabad (arranged by the Norwegian Embassy) and at the Norwegian/Nordic Association of Development Researchers (Copenhagen 2011).

²⁰ German Agency for International Cooperation

²¹ Federally Administered Tribal Areas